



### TRADITION MODERATION RELIGIOUS AS ISLAMIC BOARDING SCHOOL CULTURE: COMPARATIVE STUDY IN REGENCY SIMALUNGUN

Sopian Lubis<sup>1</sup>, Syamsu Nahar<sup>2</sup>, Dedi Masri<sup>3</sup>

<sup>123</sup> Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara Medan, Indonesia

Jl. William Iskandar Ps. V, Medan Estate, Kec. Percut Sei Tuan, Kab. Deli Serdang,

Sumatera Utara. , Kota Medan, Prov. Sumatera Utara

[sopianlubis1975@gmail.com](mailto:sopianlubis1975@gmail.com)

#### ABSTRAK

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menganalisis bagaimana moderasi beragama hidup dan bereproduksi sebagai budaya pesantren melalui sistem pendidikan moral. Di tengah meningkatnya polarisasi sosial-agama, pesantren memandang peran strategis mereka dalam membangun tradisi inklusif dan religiusitas yang seimbang. Namun, studi yang meneliti moderasi beragama sebagai budaya internalisasi dalam sistem pendidikan pesantren secara komparatif masih terbatas. Penelitian ini menggunakan pendekatan kualitatif multisitus dengan teknik pengumpulan data berupa wawancara mendalam, observasi partisipan, dan dokumentasi studi di beberapa pesantren di Kabupaten Simalungun. Analisis data dilakukan melalui model interaktif Miles, Huberman, dan Saldaña dengan tahapan kondensasi data, penyajian data, dan pengambilan kesimpulan lintas situs (analisis lintas kasus). Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa agama moderat di pesantren tidak hanya diajarkan secara normatif-doktrinal, tetapi direproduksi sebagai budaya melalui perilaku teladan kyai dan ustaz, sistem pendidikan 24 jam, pembiasaan disiplin agama, musyawarah, dan penghormatan terhadap perbedaan. Secara komparatif, ditemukan pola umum berupa integrasi tanda i'tidal (keadilan), tawazun (keseimbangan), dan tasamuh (toleransi) dalam praktik kehidupan sehari-hari santri, meskipun terdapat variasi dalam strategi implementasi yang dipengaruhi oleh karakter kepemimpinan dan konteks lembaga masing-masing pesantren. Temuan ini memperkuat bahwa pendidikan moral berperan sebagai media utama internalisasi tanda moderasi sehingga membentuk tradisi religiusitas inklusif dan adaptif dalam konteks masyarakat plural. Penelitian ini berkontribusi pada pengembangan model konseptual moderasi agama sebagai budaya pendidikan pesantren.

**Kata Kunci:** agama moderat, budaya sekolah berasrama Islam, moral pendidikan

#### ABSTRACT

*Study This aim analyze How moderation religious live and reproduce as a pesantren culture through system education morals. In the middle increasing polarization socio-religious, Islamic boarding schools viewed own role strategic in build tradition inclusive and balanced religiosity. However, studies that examine moderation religious as an internalized culture in system education Islamic boarding school in a way comparative Still limited. Research This use approach qualitative multi-site with technique data collection in the form of interview in-depth, observation participatory, and study documentation on several Islamic boarding schools in the Regency Simalungun. Data analysis was carried out through the interactive model of Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña with stages data condensation, data presentation, and retrieval conclusion cross- site (cross-case analysis). Research result show that moderation religion in Islamic boarding schools No taught in a way normative-doctrinal only, but reproduced as a culture through exemplary behavior of kyai and ustaz, system 24-hour education, habituation discipline religious, deliberation, and respect to differences. In terms of comparative, found pattern general in the form of integration mark i'tidal (justice), tawazun (balance), and tasamuh (tolerance) in practice daily life santri, even though there is variations in*

*implementation strategies influenced by character leadership and context the institutions of each Islamic boarding school. Findings This strengthen that education morals play a role as the main medium internalization mark moderation so that form tradition inclusive and adaptive religiosity in context plural society. Research This contribute to the development of conceptual models moderation religious as an educational culture Islamic boarding school.*

**Keywords:** *moderation religion, Islamic boarding school culture, education morals*

## INTRODUCTION

Phenomenon polarization socio-religious in the last decade This become global issues that affect stability social polarization in various countries, including Indonesia. the no only looks in contestation political identity, but also in strengthening exclusivism religiousness, spread discourse intolerance and fragmentation social based identity religious perspective. sociology of religion, conditions This can understood as consequence from increasing political identity and competition symbolic in space modern public that narrows room cross- dialogue groups (Berger, 1967). In Indonesia, the dynamics This appear in various incident socio -religious shows existence tension between commitment religious and cohesion social nationality (Bruinessen, 2010).

Responding condition mentioned, moderation religious appear as a strategic agenda nationally promoted in a way systematically by the Ministry of Religion of the Republic of Indonesia through strengthening programs mark *moderate* in life religious (Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia, *Moderasi Beragama*, 2019). Moderation understood as method a just (i'tidal), balanced ( *tawazun* ), and tolerant ( *tasamuh* ) religion , which rejects extremism Good in form radicalism and liberalism excessive (Azra, 2020). In the context of Islamic education, moderation no just positioned as teaching materials, but as paradigm in build character inclusive and adaptive religiosity to diversity social (Shihab, 2019).

However thus, some big studies about moderation religious Still focus on dimensions policy, discourse normative, or studies case single in the institution certain. Situational studies moderation as a living and reproduced culture in a way systemic in tradition education Islamic boarding schools, especially through approach comparative cross institutions, relative Still limited. In fact, in general theoretical, values social will endure No only through formal transmission, but through the reproduction process ongoing cultural in practice daily life and systems institutionalized social (Bourdieu, 1977). Islamic boarding school as institutions Islamic education with system 24 hour life has potential unique in reproduce mark through role models, habits, and structure relation distinctive social.

Regency Simalungun is an area with composition a pluralistic society ethnicity and religion, Islamic boarding schools No only functioning as institution education, but also as agent social that forms pattern religiosity community surrounding area. Therefore that's important for study How moderation religious life as traditions and culture of Islamic boarding schools, as well as How pattern the appear in a way comparative on several institution Islamic education in the region.

Based on background behind said, research This focus on analysis tradition moderation religious as a pesantren culture through studies comparative in the Regency Simalungun. Research This aim to: (1) identify pattern internalization mark moderation in system education Islamic boarding school; (2) compare form reproduction of moderate culture in some Islamic boarding schools; and (3) formulating a conceptual model

moderation religious as an educational culture Islamic boarding school. With Thus, research This expected can give contribution theoretical in development studies Islamic education and sociology of religion, as well as enrich discourse about strengthening religiosity inclusive in a plural society.

## RESEARCH METHOD

Study This use approach qualitative with design multi-site study for analyze tradition moderation religious as a culture of Islamic boarding schools in the Regency Simalungun. Approach qualitative chosen Because study This make an effort understand meaning, practice, and dynamics internalization mark moderation in context natural and complex social environment(Creswell & Poth, 2018). Multi -site design allows researchers compare pattern practice and variation implementation between Islamic boarding school so that produce greater understanding comprehensive compared to studies case single(Yin, 2018). With approach this research no only describe phenomena, but also identify pattern general and characteristics contextual in each institution.

Study done on several cottage modern Islamic boarding schools in the Regency Simalungun which has characteristics institutional and background social different. Site selection is done purposively with consider relevance to focus research, namely practice education morals and implementation mark moderation religious in Islamic boarding school culture(Miles, Huberman, & Saldana, 2014). Subject study covering leadership Islamic boarding schools (kyai), ustaz / ustazah, as well as students involved direct in practice education and life daily life at the Islamic boarding school.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### Findings

Based on searches conducted researchers, that in the Regency there are 11 cottages Islamic boarding schools registered in the Ministry of Religion's Educational Management System (EMIS) as in the table following:

**Table 1.** Pondok Data Islamic Boarding Schools in the Regency Simalunun  
Odd Semester 2025/2026

No	NSPP	Pondok Pesantren	Program	Alamat
1	510012080003	Luqman	Kitab Kuning Pondok Pesantren PSP	Desa Bandar Tongah Kec. Bandar Hulan Simalungun 21184
2	510012080009	Darul Misbah	Kitab Kuning	Desa Kasindir Kec. Jorlang Hataran Simalungun 21172
3	510012080012	Darul Muttaqin	Kitab Kuning Pondok Pesantren PSP	Desa Karang Anyar Kec. Gunung Maligas Simalungun 21176
4	510012080015	Al Barokah	Kitab Kuning Berjenjang	Desa Silinduk Kec. Dolok Batu Nanggar Simalungun 21155
5	510012080016	Surya Agung	Kitab Kuning Pondok Pesantren PSP	Jl. Ir H A E Nainggolan, MM Kec. Bandar, Simalungun 21184

6	510012080017	Nurul Iman	Kitab Kuning Pondok Pesantren PSP	Desa Silau Dunia Kahean Simalungun 21157
7	510012080018	Al Kautsar	Kitab Kuning Pondok Pesantren PSP	Karang Anom Kel. Panei Tengah Kec. Panei Simalungun 21161
8	510212080010	Al Hijrah	Kitab Kuning Berjenjang	Desa Balimbingan Kec. Tanah Jawa Simalungun 21181
9	510212080011	MBS Darul Arqom	Kitab Kuning Pondok Pesantren PSP	Desa Kerasaan 1 Kec. Pematang Bandar Simalungun 21186
10	510312080001	Baitussalam	Kitab Kuning Pondok Pesantren PSP	Desa Naga Jaya I Kec. Bandar Huluhan Simalungun 21184
11	510312080008	Istiqomah	Kitab Kuning	Desa Maligas Tengah Kec. Tanah Jawa Simalungun 21181

Source: Islamic Boarding School Emis Database Odd 2025/2026

Furthermore is description of the culture of Islamic boarding schools in the Regency Simalungun North Sumatra as following;

1. Themes of Moderation Culture per Islamic Boarding School

a. Al Kautsar Islamic Boarding School: Moderation as Habituation Morals and Exemplary Behavior

Moderation religious practice at the boarding school Al Kautsar Islamic Boarding School No taught in a way explicit as eye lesson alone, but rather integrated in education morals and systems life everyday life. The values of balance (*tawazun*) and justice (*i' tidal*) are apparent in the way of kyai and ustaz confirm importance value difference opinion in the deliberation forum students. Under observation field, difference view jurisprudence No become source conflict, but made into material discussion guided.

The exemplary behavior of the kyai becomes center reproduction values. The way the kyai responds internal and external differences external Islamic boarding school, showing practice concrete moderate, not reactive, no exclusive, and permanent guard principle creed. System 24-hour education strengthens the internalization process the through habituation of manners, religious discipline, and ethics social. the dominant cultural ema in Pondok Al Kautsar Islamic Boarding School in form; exemplary religious leadership; deliberation as practice tolerance; and moral integration in all over activity.

b. Islamic boarding school Baitussalam; Moderation as System Discipline Collective

Moderation religious at the Islamic Boarding School Islamic boarding school Baitussalam appear strong in structure institutions and regulations students. Observation show that the dormitory life system emphasizes mark balance between firmness rules and dialogue space. Violations No completed with approach repressive, but through coaching based personal advice and approach.

Ustadz in a interview state that students accustomed to For No easy judging practice religious somebody and group different societies. Practices This seen when students do activity devotion society in a pluralistic environment; they interact in a way open without attitude exclusive. With Thus, the theme cultural aspects that stand out in Islamic boarding schools This in the form of; Discipline religious based coaching; Strengthening social etiquette; and Interaction inclusive with public around.

c. Al Barokah Islamic Boarding School: Moderation as Curriculum Integration and Dialogue

Meanwhile, at the Al Barokah Islamic boarding school, it shows integration mark moderation in formal curriculum and activities Extracurricular activities. Morals and Islamic jurisprudence material often associated with context nationality and diversity social. Teachers do not only explain evidence, but also relevance social.

d. Observation show the existence of a regular discussion forum that provides room for students for convey view in a way open. Difference No viewed as threat, but as part from the learning process. So the theme mainstay in Islamic boarding schools This is; Integration of values moderation in curriculum; Student dialogue forum; and contextualization religious teachings.

2. Matrix Cross-Site Comparative

**Table 2.** Findings field analyzed for obtain comparative data, as matrix following;

<b>Dimensions of Moderation Culture</b>	<b>Islamic boarding school Al Kautsar</b>	<b>Islamic boarding school Baitussalam</b>	<b>Islamic boarding school Al Barokah</b>
Kyai's Exemplary Behavior	Very dominant	Dominant	Dominant
24 Hour System	Strong	Very strong	Strong
Deliberation & Dialogue	Strong	Currently	Very strong
Curriculum Integration	Currently	Currently	Very strong
Interaction Social Inclusive	Strong	Strong	Strong

Matrix This show that all over Islamic boarding school has a relatively moderate basis strong, but There is difference in approach implementative.

3. General Patterns and Variations

a. General Pattern: Moderation as Internalized Culture

Analysis cross- site shows existence pattern relatively general consistent in practice moderation religion in Islamic boarding schools Simalungun Regency. *First*, moderation No positioned as draft normative that is taught in a way explicit in form eye lesson alone, but rather present as inherent value in system education morals and practices daily life santri. The values of balance (tawazun), justice (i'tidal), and tolerance (tasamuh) are integrated in relation social, habituation of worship, as well as ethics interaction between inhabitant Islamic boarding school. *Second*, education morals become the main medium internalization mark moderation. All Islamic boarding school show that formation character more



emphasized than strengthening discourse ideological. Moderation realized through habituation of manners, respect to difference opinion in the deliberation forum, as well as attitude open to reality pluralistic society. In the context of this, value moderation reproduced No through approach doctrinal, but rather through ongoing habituation in system life collective.

*Third*, the system education boarding- based (24 hours) role significant in strengthen the reproductive process value. Intensity interaction between kyai, ustaz, and santri create room social enabling values the No only understood in a way cognitive, but experienced in a way direct in practice daily life. With Thus, moderation religious transform become a habitus, namely trend relative behavior stable and internalized in self students.

In a way general, pattern This show that moderation religion in Islamic boarding schools Simalungun develop as a growing organic culture from structure education and tradition institutional, not solely as response to policy external.

b. Variation Contextual: Differentiation of Implementation Strategy

Although there is pattern consistent general research this also found variation contextual on the implementation strategy of a culture of moderation. Variations the No lies in the substance values, but rather on mechanisms and emphasis practices in each Islamic boarding school.

In some Islamic boarding school, the exemplary behavior of the kyai becomes factor dominant in the formation of a culture of moderation. Moral authority and charisma leadership play role central in determine pattern relation social and attitudes religiosity santri. Moderation reflected especially through how the kyai responds difference, taking decisions, and building communication with public around.

Temporary that, other Islamic boarding schools show emphasis on the system institutions and regulations as instrument reproduction value. Moderation reflected in balance between discipline and approach persuasive in coaching santri. In this model, the structure rule become an important medium in form character inclusive and not reactive.

On the other hand, there are more Islamic boarding schools highlight integration mark moderation in formal curriculum and dialogue forums. Discussion open, contextualization teaching materials, as well as learning reflective become means main in develop awareness proportional religiosity.

Variation This show that culture of moderation nature adaptive to character leadership, tradition institutional and contextual social aspects of each Islamic boarding school. However, Thus, the difference in strategy still culminating in the formation of pattern relative religiosity in line in matter balance, appreciation to differences, and reinforcement morals social.

In a way analytical, findings This indicates that tradition moderation religion in Islamic boarding schools Regency Simalungun has two characters main; (1) Substance mark homogeneous, in the form of internalization principle balance, justice and tolerance in life Islamic boarding schools; (2) Heterogeneous implementation strategies, influenced by the dynamics leadership, structure organization, and approach pedagogical.

With Thus, moderation religion in Islamic boarding schools No can understood as a uniform normative program, but rather as a growing culture through mechanism reproduction contextual and adaptive values. This pattern at a time confirm that Islamic boarding school own internal capacity in build tradition inclusive religiosity without lost identity theological.

### **Discussion:**

#### **Simalungun Moderation Culture Model: Moderation as Institutional Habitus**

Findings study show that moderation religion in Islamic boarding schools Regency Simalungun No present as a normative slogan, but rather develop as internalized institutional culture the values of balance (tawazun), justice (i'tidal), and tolerance (tasamuh) are not taught as discourse ideological only, but practiced through habituation of manners, relations social, as well as ethics collective life Islamic boarding school.

This model can understood through draft Pierre Bourdieu's *habitus* , namely system disposition formed through the internalization process term long in something room social certain (Berger, 1967). In the context of Islamic boarding school Simalungun, a 24-hour dormitory system forms Medan social enabling mark moderation reproduced in a way repetitive until become trend stable behavior, Islamic boarding school capable integrate dimensions intellectual, spiritual, and social in One pattern life collective (Nahar, 2018). With Thus, moderation No only become knowledge, but become trend ethical. In a way theoretically, this model is also in line with Clifford Geertz's view of religion as system institutionalized meaning in practice social (Geertz, 1960). Moderation in Islamic boarding schools no just text normative, but rather become pattern the meaning that forms orientation action students in respond reality plurality social.

#### **Factors Forming a Culture of Moderation**

Four factor main as findings in forming a culture of moderation in Islamic boarding schools Simalungun :

- a. Tradition Islamic Boarding School Science: The Roots of Moderation based on tradition science field jurisprudence schools of thought, Sufism, and adab that emphasize balance between text and context. Characters *moderate* Islamic boarding school Indonesia based turats (classical books) (Bruinessen & Kuning, 2012). Condition ongoing hereditary without close self from adaptation local wisdom.
- b. Environment Social Pluralism of Simalungun Regency Simalungun own composition heterogeneous socio- religious reality. This demand Islamic boarding school for develop pattern adaptive and inclusive relationships. Construction theory Berger and Luckmann's social explain that mark social formed through interaction dialectical between individuals and social structures (Berger & Luckmann, 1966). With thus, plurality external participate form awareness internal moderation of Islamic boarding schools.
- c. System Habituation Collective; Moderation values practiced through congregational worship routines, deliberations, and interactions between students. This process reflect theory learning Albert Bandura's social theory, that behavior formed through observation and imitation towards significant social models (Bandura, 1977).

- d. Moral Education; Moderation attached to education morals, not separated as discourse political-religious. This is in accordance with the thoughts of Syed Muhammad Naquib al-Attas who places adab at the core of Islamic education (al-Attas, 1999). In context this, moderation is expression from mature morals.

Consistency pattern education Islamic boarding schools in the Regency Simalungun is findings cross- site can served in three points. *First*, moderation rooted in tradition science Islamic boarding schools that originate from from *turats* (yellow book), in field jurisprudence schools of thought, Sufism, and education morals that provide foundation normative. Tradition This form framework epistemologically which inherent contain principle balance and appreciation to difference. *Second*, the value that comes from from the classical books (*turast* ), mediated by the leadership of the kyai. In this case this, variation between Islamic boarding school show difference intensity role figure central, but all of it confirm importance moral authority in transform mark become practice. What is needed understood that, leadership no source values, but rather a mediator who translates norms into example social. *Third*, the system education Islamic boarding school (24-hour dormitory based) becomes mechanism reproduction main intellectuality (Nahar & Suhendri, 2020). Intensity interaction, habituation collective, as well as integration between formal and non-formal education creates room social enabling mark practiced in a way Continuous. Repetitive process This transform mark become relative disposition stable, or in term sociologically, becoming a habitus. With Thus, research This confirm that moderation in Islamic boarding schools Simalungun is results from chain mechanism:



Mechanism chart reproduction mark moderation in Islamic boarding schools Simalungun. This model potential applied to the study other Islamic education for test consistency mechanism reproduction of a culture of moderation in context different social.

### Leadership Role: Moral Authority as Cultural Driver

Findings show that the kyai and leaders Islamic boarding school own role central in form direction of a culture of moderation. Leadership they No only administrative, but symbolic and normative. Exemplary become the main medium internalization mark. In a way theoretically, Max Weber explains that authority charismatic own strength transformative in form orientation collective community religious (Weber, 1978). At the Islamic boarding school Simalungun, the charisma of the kyai strengthens legitimacy mark moderation as a respected social norm. More far, theory leadership transformational (Bass & Riggio) affirms that inspiring leader moral values are capable form commitment ethical his followers (Bass & Riggio, 2006). Practice leadership in Islamic boarding schools show character this, where moderation inherited through exemplary behavior attitude , not just formal instructions .

### **System: Total Reproduction of Values**

Uniqueness Islamic boarding school located in the system education 24-hour dormitory -based system This allows integration between formal, non-formal, and habituation education social in One room unified life. In perspective theory reproduction cultural Bourdieu and Passeron, institutions education play a role in transmit mark through practice structured daily life(Bourdieu & Passeron, 1990). The boarding system strengthens intensity internalization Because interaction ongoing without pause between teachers and students.

This model is also suitable with draft Erving Goffman's *total institution*, where the integrated environment form pattern behavior collective in a way consistent(Goffman, 1961). However, it is different with a coercive model, Islamic boarding schools Simalungun show that reproduction mark ongoing through approach persuasive and exemplary, not domination structural.

### **State of the Art Positioning**

In a way general, study previously about moderation religion in Islamic boarding schools tend focuses on: (a) Moderation as state policy or agenda of the Ministry of Religion; (b) Normative-theological studies about draft wasathiyah; (c) Case study single on one Islamic boarding school certain.

Study This offer contribution different in three matter Main: *First*, research This put moderation as a reproduced culture through system education morals, not just as normative discourse; *Second*, the approach comparative cross Islamic boarding schools in the Regency Simalungun show pattern general at a time variation contextual; *Third*, research This integrate analysis leadership and systems 24-hour education as variables key forming a habitus of moderation. With thus, the article This expand discourse moderation religious from a conceptual level going to analysis sociological- institutional based practice real.

### **CONCLUSION**

Study This show that tradition moderation religion in Islamic boarding schools Regency Simalungun No formed as response policy or discourse normative external, but rather as results reproduction structured culture in system education Islamic boarding school. Through approach comparative cross- site, found pattern general that mark tawazun, tasamuh, and i'tidal rooted in tradition science Islamic boarding schools, mediated by the moral leadership of the kyai, as well as reinforced by the system education 24-hour dormitory based. Although there is implementation strategy variations between Islamic boarding school, good through domination personal role model, strengthening system institutional, as well as approach dialogic substance mark moderation still consistent. This is show that moderation religious in context Islamic boarding school Simalungun is a stable and adaptive institutional habitus to plurality social. With Thus, research This answer focus main proposed in introduction, namely How moderation reproduced as a pesantren culture in context pluralistic society. Findings This show that Islamic boarding school own functioning internal mechanisms in a way preventive to polarization socio-religious through formation disposition sustainable ethics.

## BIBLIOGERAPHY

- al-Attas, S. M. N. (1999). *The Concept of Education in Islam (Kuala Lumpur: ISTAC* (pp. 1–15). pp. 1–15.
- Azra, A. (2020). *Islam Nusantara: Jaringan Global dan Lokal*. Jakarta: Prenadamedia Group.
- Bandura, A. (1977). *Social Learning Theory*. Prentice Hall.
- Bass, B. M., & Riggio, R. E. (2006). *Transformational Leadership* (2nd ed.). New York: Psychology Press.
- Berger, P. L. (1967). *The Sacred Canopy: Elements of a Sociological Theory of Religion*. New York: Anchor Books.
- Berger, P. L., & Luckmann, T. (1966). *The Social Construction of Reality*. New York: Anchor Books.
- Bourdieu, P. (1977). *Outline of a Theory of Practice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bourdieu, P., & Passeron, J.-C. (1990). *Reproduction in Education, Society and Culture*. London: Sage.
- Bruinessen, M. (2010). Indonesian Muslims and Their Place in the Larger World of Islam. *Indonesia, 90*, 117.
- Bruinessen, M., & Kuning, K. (2012). *Pesantren dan Tarekat*. Yogyakarta: Gading Publishing.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches* (4th ed.). Los Angeles: Sage.
- Geertz, C. (1960). *The Religion of Java*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Goffman, E. (1961). *Asylums: Essays on the Social Situation of Mental Patients and Other Inmates*. New York: Anchor Books.
- Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia, *Moderasi Beragama*. (2019). Jakarta: Badan Litbang dan Diklat.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2014). *Qualitative Data Analysis, A Methods Sourcebook* (3rd ed.). USA: Sage Publications.
- Nahar, S. (2018). *Sistem Pendidikan Pesantren dan Pembentukan Karakter*. Medan: Perdana Publishing.
- Nahar, S., & Suhendri, G. I.-I. P. I. K. H. (2020). *Hasyim Asy'ary*. Indramayu: Penerbit Adab CV.Adanu Abimata.
- Shihab, M. Q. (2019). *Wasathiyah: Wawasan Islam tentang Moderasi Beragama*. Jakarta: Lentera Hati.
- Weber, M. (1978). *Economy and Society* (E. Fischhoff, Trans.). Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Yin, R. K. (2018). *Case Study Research and Applications: Design and Methods*. SAGE Publications, 2018, California.